Neighborhood Design & Life Safety

Issues & Trade-offs

Patrick Siegman
Nelson\ Nygaard Consulting Associates

Oct 3, 2008
Agenda

1. Neighborhood Design – Questions to Consider

2. Some trade-offs
   - Advantages of wide streets
   - Advantage of narrow streets

3. Additional issues & trade-offs

4. Codes that require connectivity & allow narrow streets
Neighborhood Design – Questions to Consider

1. What are the dangers? (fire safety, traffic safety, medical emergencies, etc.)
One goal: improve life safety

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>United States, 1999</th>
<th>Fatalities</th>
<th>Injuries</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>3,671</td>
<td>21,875</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traffic</td>
<td>41,611</td>
<td>3,236,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Emergency medical response – ??? lives saved

My background

- 14 years as a transportation planner
- No formal training in fire safety or emergency response
Neighborhood Design - Questions to Consider

2. What is the existing context for the proposed project?
24 feet

Southgate Neighborhood, Palo Alto
Existing context - Two Examples

1. The proposed project would be added to a community where all existing streets are wide, and the community’s existing equipment & staffing levels were chosen on the assumption that all streets would be wide.

2. The proposed project will add one more block to an existing community that has many narrow streets. The community’s fire department already has the staff, training & equipment needed for operating on these streets.
Issue: Mutual Aid Obligations

Fire departments have mutual aid obligations to fight fires & respond to disasters in many communities
Many earthquake zones have old neighborhoods with narrow streets (San Francisco, Berkeley, Palo Alto, etc.)

24 feet

Southgate Neighborhood, Palo Alto
Many high fire hazard areas (Lake Arrowhead, CA; Oakland Hills, CA; Paradise, CA; Santa Cruz County, CA, San Diego County, CA) have narrow streets in mountainous, forested terrain.
Mutual Aid Obligations: How can departments respond if their apparatus cannot fit (at least, not easily) on existing narrow streets?
Neighborhood Design – Questions to Consider

2. Costs & Benefits: What do things cost and who has to pay for them? (fire department budget, public works dept. budget, home prices & rents, etc.)
Costs & Benefits - Examples

1. What does it cost to build, equip, staff and maintain a firehouse?
2. What does it cost to purchase a new ladder truck?
3. What does it cost to build & maintain one linear mile of street at 36’ width, instead of 26’ width (including land value)?
Advantages of narrow streets
Advantages of narrow streets

Street Width and Injury Accident Rate

4th Order Polynomial ($R^2 = 0.52$)
Advantages of Wide Streets
1. Wide streets allow one fire vehicle to pass another.
1. Wide streets allow one fire vehicle to pass another.
Two Basic Approaches

1. Design streets to accommodate existing fire apparatus & staffing

2. Alter fire apparatus & staffing to accommodate smaller streets
Alternate approach: go around the block

*Connected Street Networks.* Connected street networks provide multiple ways for emergency response vehicles to access a particular location and multiple evacuation routes. In addition, a connected street system encourages slow, cautious driving since drivers encounter cross traffic at frequent intervals.
Potential solution: limit block length

√ Connected Street Networks. Connected street networks provide multiple ways for emergency response vehicles to access a particular location and multiple evacuation routes. In addition, a connected street system encourages slow, cautious driving since drivers encounter cross traffic at frequent intervals.
Potential solution: limit block perimeter

--connected-street-networks-

Connected street networks provide multiple ways for emergency response vehicles to access a particular location and multiple evacuation routes. In addition, a connected street system encourages slow, cautious driving since drivers encounter cross traffic at frequent intervals.

- typical-subdivision-cul-de-sacs
- well-connected-street-network
Potential solution: Limit cul-de-sac length

√ Connected Street Networks. Connected street networks provide multiple ways for emergency response vehicles to access a particular location and multiple evacuation routes. In addition, a connected street system encourages slow, cautious driving since drivers encounter cross traffic at frequent intervals.
2. Wide streets provide room to connect hoses to pumps on the side of an engine & room to work around them
2. Wide streets provide room to connect hoses to pumps on the side of an engine & room to work around them
Potential solution: provide 20’ clear width at set-up zones.
Potential solution: provide 20’ clear width at set-up zones

- Provide mid-block bulb-outs with red curbs at least every 150’
- Provide bulb-outs at intersections to allow staging
- Provide paired driveways, which creates clear zones
Alternate approach: connect hoses to pumps on the rear of an engine.
Alternate approach: connect hoses to pumps on the rear of an engine.
3. Wide streets provide room to open swing-out doors on equipment cabinets & work around them (while wearing air packs)
Potential solution: provide 20’ clear width at set-up zones
Alternate approach: Use roll-up doors on equipment cabinets
Alternate approach: Use roll-up doors on equipment cabinets

http://www.bucksfire.gov.uk/BucksFire/Fire+Stations/Meet+the+fleet/BLE1-KX55PMO.htm
4. Wide streets provide room to deploy ladder racks to sides of fire engines
Alternate approach: use manual ladder racks
Alternate approach: use ladder racks that deploy to the rear
5. Wide streets provide room to deploy stabilizers on aerial ladder trucks
Potential solution: require wide streets only where aerial ladder will need to be deployed (i.e. buildings taller than X feet)
Alternate approach: use aerial ladder trucks (Metz, etc.) with outriggers that require less width.

Rosenbauer Raptor brochure: “Over 100' reach but drives like a pumper. The Raptor's short wheelbase allows this rescue-platform to maneuver in tight or congested street where others imply cannot. For this reason, the Raptor was a natural fit in the narrow streets of tourist communities such as Nantucket Island, Mass.”
Alternate approach: use aerial ladder trucks (Metz, etc.) with outriggers that require less width

- The Out-and-Down Jacking System
- All four METZ Out-and-Down Outriggers can be extended to their maximum spread of 14 ft. 9 in. within 20 seconds. No jack pins are required so that the aerial can be raised as soon as the electronic ground pressure sensors have detected ground contact. Even short jacked at 8 ft. 3 in. the ladder can still be rotated 360 degrees and extended to its full height. The maximum horizontal reach, though, is then automatically limited by the METZ Operating System.
Alternate approach: use aerial ladder trucks (Metz, etc.) with outriggers that require less width

http://www.bucksfire.gov.uk/BucksFire/Fire+Stations/Meet+the+fleet/TurntableLadder.htm
6. Wide streets provide adequate turning radii at corners & curves
Potential solution: test street designs using turning templates for the fire apparatus that will need to use those streets; provide extra width only where needed
Alternate approach: use fire apparatus with better turning radii (‘Milwaukee Engine’ from Pierce, etc.)
7. Wide streets provide room for high-speed driving, meaning faster response times
Potential solution: reduce response distance, since
response time = speed * distance

- Require connectivity
- Require compact neighborhoods
Response time = average speed * response distance

To improve response times

Option 1: Increase speeds

Option 2: Reduce response distances
  • Design shorter routes from firehouse to homes
  • Keep homes closer to existing firehouses
Benefits of Street Connectivity

1. More trips stay on local streets => less congestion on arterial streets
2. More direct routes => Shorter response distances
Benefits of Street Connectivity

1. More trips stay on local streets => less congestion on arterial streets
2. More direct routes => Shorter response distances
Benefits of Street Connectivity

1. More trips stay on local streets => less congestion on arterial streets
2. More direct routes => Shorter response distances
Benefits of Street Connectivity

1. More trips stay on local streets => less congestion on arterial streets
2. More direct routes => Shorter response distances
Comparing Street Connectivity

An Existing Chico Subdivision
Comparing Street Connectivity

Proposed Plan
Response time = average speed * response distance

To improve response times

Option 1: Increase speeds

Option 2: Reduce response distances
- Design shorter routes from firehouse to homes
- Keep homes closer to existing firehouses
Doe Mill in Chico, CA: 8 units/acre
Sierra Nevada: < 1 unit/acre
an example of “ex-urban sprawl”
Response time
= average speed * response distance
Codes that require connectivity & allow narrow streets
Communities with street connectivity ordinances

Portland, OR
Beaverton, OR
Eugene, OR
Fort Collins, CO
Boulder, CO
Cary, NC
Huntersville, NC
Cornelius, NC
Conover, NC
Middleton, DE
Orlando, FL
Etc.

Figure 6-1 Example Local Street Circulation Patterns

Preferred

Discouraged

Original Source: Tri-County Metropolitan Transportation District of Oregon (Tri-Met), Planning and Design for Transit, 1993. (Modified by City of Salem)
Two Basic Approaches

1. Design streets to accommodate existing fire apparatus & staffing

2. Alter fire apparatus & staffing to accommodate smaller streets
9. Wide streets provide room to maneuver around illegally parked cars
Potential solution: use bulb-outs, other design measures to discourage illegal parking
Potential solution: require connected streets, so one can go around the block
10. Wide streets allow aerial ladder trucks to deploy ladders to intermediate stories
Potential solution: define space required to deploy aerial ladders to each building
11. Wide streets allow firefighters and apparatus to stay out of the collapse zone for buildings
Potential solution: define the collapse zone for each building, provide space to keep apparatus out of it
12. On major routes, wide streets provide room to maneuver around traffic congestion.
Potential solution: provide bicycle lanes to provide space to pull over
Potential solution: provide bus-only lanes to create uncongested lanes
Potential solution: provide spaces to pass over medians
Potential solution: pass over centerline
Potential solution: require connected streets to provide (a) alternate routes and (b) reduce congestion on major routes
Potential solution: use congestion pricing, maximum parking requirements, etc. to eliminate congestion
Other Advantages of narrow streets
Lower Maintenance Costs

Phoenix, AZ: 4-foot narrower streets save $70,000 a mile in repaving costs
Greater Housing Affordability

“each 10 feet of required street width reduces the supply of homes by 3 to 4 percentage points.”

- University of Wisconsin-Madison Center for Urban Land Economics Research
Greater energy efficiency

Visalia, CA: Reducing street width by 8 feet lowered ambient temperatures 10 degrees to 15 degrees Fahrenheit.
Reduced pavement
= reduced stormwater runoff
= reduced pollutant loadings